

78
EDICAL LIBRARY
GENERAL LIBRARY
UNIV. OF MICHIGAN

MAP - 139

The Classical Weekly

Published on Monday, October 1 to May 31, except in weeks in which there is a legal or School holiday (Election Day, Thanksgiving Day, Christmas Day, New Year's Day, Lincoln's Birthday, Washington's Birthday, Easter Sunday, Decoration Day). Place of publication, Barnard College, New York. In the United States of America, \$2.00 per volume; elsewhere \$2.50. Single numbers, to subscribers 15 cents, to others 25 cents. Address Charles Knapp, 1737 Sedgwick Avenue, New York.

Entered as second-class matter, November 18, 1907, at the Post Office, New York, N. Y., under the Act of Congress of March 3, 1879. Acceptance for mailing at special rate provided for in Section 1103, Act of October 3, 1917, authorized June 28, 1918.

VOLUME XXV, No. 16

MONDAY, FEBRUARY 29, 1932

WHOLE NO. 679

"FEW texts achieve such vividness. Few possess to such a degree the quality of stirring the interest of the reader. One can read the chapters of this book, close his eyes, and imagine he sees the men and women of Rome going about their daily occupations; he can imagine he sees the Roman state spreading its influence over the world".



GRANT SHOWERMAN'S *new book*—

ROME AND THE ROMANS

inspires these enthusiastic comments



Capitalize this interest in your Latin classes—an intimate knowledge of the Romans will do more than anything else to stimulate class-interest. **ROME AND THE ROMANS** "makes the Romans next-door neighbors in everything but time".

\$2.40

THE MACMILLAN COMPANY

New York Boston Chicago Dallas Atlanta San Francisco

Favorites for the Third and Fourth Years



**MOORE AND BARSS
ORATIONS OF CICERO**

With a selection from his Letters. This new edition of a popular Cicero contains in one volume all the reading, grammar, and composition now recommended for third-year work.

**GREENOUGH-KITTREDGE-JENKINS
VIRGIL**

This beautiful bimillennial edition includes, in addition to the first six books of the Aeneid, selections from Ovid, Horace, Catullus, and Tibullus, a passage from Book VIII of the Aeneid, and one from the Georgics.

Circulars on request

GINN AND COMPANY

Boston New York Chicago Atlanta Dallas Columbus San Francisco

The Classical Weekly

VOLUME XXV, No. 16

MONDAY, FEBRUARY 29, 1932

WHOLE NO. 679

THE LITERARY LINEAGE OF CUPID¹

It does not fall within the scope of this paper to discuss, except incidentally, the character of Amor in Latin literature or the myriad representations of the god in ancient art. This I hope to do in two subsequent articles. For the present I shall deal with the cult of Eros in Grecian antiquity and shall then pass to a detailed consideration of the parentage, appearance, specialized activities, and general character of Eros in Greek literature^{1a}.

The word *eros* is, strictly, a more general term than either *himeros* (desire aroused by an object or a person actually present) or *pothos* (yearning for an absent object or person). This distinction is not always preserved in earlier Greek literature; in Alexandrian and later Greek poetry the three words become at times synonymous². For that matter *Eros* is not uniformly

rendered in Latin by *Amor*, nor is *Himeros* uniformly rendered in Latin by *Cupido*³. Further, the line between *eros* in the abstract and Eros personified is not always easy to draw.

Erotes, the plural form of Eros, used as early as Pindar, sometimes means little more than 'Love' in the singular; in Nonnus, for example, it is often used at the end of a verse merely for metrical reasons. But the nature of lovers is varied, and Love himself has both a good and a bad side. Consequently the plural, *Erotes*, is occasionally used to denote this diversity⁴.

The ancient Greek worship of Eros or Pothos never attained the proportions of a national or Panhellenic cult. It remained local only. Indeed, Phaedrus complains⁵ that, while other gods have hymns and paeans written for them by the poets, Eros, a god so ancient and so great, has not even an encomium. Euripides⁶ makes his chorus of Troezenian women say, 'Eros, tyrant of men...we do not worship'. Perhaps Euripides passes over as local and trivial, or perhaps (this seems hard to believe) he was entirely ignorant of, the various cults of Eros at Thespiae in Boeotia, Parion in the Hellespont, and Leuctra on the west coast of Laconia. Of course, the situation depicted in the Hippolytus is extremely emotional. The chorus, in no mood to pursue research into minor antiquities, is talking about the circumstances which confront it in the play.

The Thespians had always honored and in Pausanias's day continued to honor Eros more than any other god. The Erotidia, the festival which they celebrated in his honor near Helicon every fifth year, included athletic and musical contests, with prizes⁷. By the time of Plutarch the contest of harpers at least had become a bore and was largely 'fixed' by previous arrangement⁸.

No one knows who introduced this festival. According to legend it had its origin in the folly of a beautiful youth. Narcissus, disdaining all offers of friendship, gave to one of his suitors a sword and bade him use it. The luckless youth committed suicide. Narcissus, hopelessly in love with his own image, felt that his infatuation was a proper punishment for his hardheartedness and so ended his life. The Thespians thereafter worshipped Eros more than all other gods in atonement for the initial offence of one of their citizens

(N. 25.154); like Eros he is the son of Aphrodite, and accompanies her (*Aeschylus, Suppliants* 1038); both he and Eros have missiles (*Aeschylus, Prometheus Bound* 648). The Pothoi have feet swift as the wind (A. P. 10.21); they are double-winged, woman-mad (A. P. 9.16, 570).

³Compare Cicero, *Tusculanae Disputationes* 4.69 with *De Natura Deorum* 3.58.

⁴Compare Cormutus, *Theologiae Graecae Compendium* 25 (page 25 in C. Lang's edition [Leipzig, Teubner, 1881]); *Mythographus Tertius Tractatus* 11, *De Venere* 18 (= A. Mai, *Classicorum Auctorum e Vaticanis Codicibus Editorum Volumen Tertium*, page 262 [Rome, 1831]). ⁵Symposium 177 A. ⁶Hippolytus 541.

⁷Pausanias 9.27.1, 31.3. Compare *Athenaeus* 13.12 (561 E); *Erot. 1.1*. ⁸Erot. 2.4.

¹This paper was read at the Twenty-fourth Annual Meeting of The Classical Association of the Atlantic States, held at Lehigh University, Bethlehem, Pennsylvania, May 1-2, 1931.

^{1a}I wish to acknowledge special indebtedness to the article *Eros* in W. H. Roscher, *Ausführliches Lexikon der Griechischen und Römischen Mythologie*, as well as to the supplementary volume, by K. F. H. Bruchmann, *Epitheta Deorum Quae Apud Poetas Graecos Leguntur* (Leipzig, Teubner, 1893). I consulted the article *Eros* in Pauly-Wissowa, *Real-Encyclopädie der Classischen Altertumswissenschaft*, and the article *Cupido* in Daremberg and Saglio, *Dictionnaire des Antiquités Grecques et Romaines*. The treatment in these essays is, however, mostly chronological rather than analytical. My own collection of references has been made independently. In general I have allowed the authors to speak for themselves, piecing the quotations or paraphrases together with only the minimum of connecting links. This method, which I have followed in order to compress a vast amount of material into the smallest possible space, may have led occasionally to obscurity. However, there is often obscurity in the language of the author whom I paraphrase. This is true of Nonnus in particular. In various places, where the language of the original is especially striking, I have put my paraphrase within single quotation-marks.

Conclusions will in general be reserved for my final articles, *Cupid in Latin Literature*, and *Cupid in Art*. To avoid monotony I have used the words *Eros* and *Love* interchangeably.

The abbreviations used in this paper, with their meanings, are as follows:

A.N. = Appendix Nova Epigrammatum, Edited by E. Cougny (Paris, Didot, 1890); A.P. = the translation, in *The Loeb Classical Library*, of the Greek Anthology (Palatine Anthology), by W. R. Paton (five volumes, 1917-1918); A. R. = Apollonius Rhodius, *Argonautica*; B. C. H. = Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique; Bergk = Theodor Bergk, *Poetae Lyrici Graeci* (Leipzig, Teubner, 1853). All the fragments of Greek lyric poetry are cited from this work; C. I. G. = August Boeckh, *Corpus Inscriptionum Graecarum* (Berlin, 1828-1877); C. S. = Constantinos Sikelotes, *Appendix Anacreonteorum*, in Bergk; D. T. = Lucian, *Dialogues of the Gods*; Erot. = Plutarch, *Eroticus*; G. G. = Georgios Grammaticos, *Appendix Anacreonteorum*, in Bergk; I. G. = *Inscriptions Graecae*, Volume 7, Edited by Wilhelm Dittenberger (Berlin, 1892). This volume = *Corpus Inscriptionum Graecarum Graeciae Septentrionalis*, Volume 1; Kaibel = Georg Kaibel, *Epigrammata Graeca Ex Lapidibus Conlecta* (Berlin, 1878); L. M. = Leon Magistros, *Appendix Anacreonteorum*, in Bergk; N. = Nonnus, *Dionysiaca*, Edited by Hermann Koechly (two volumes, Leipzig, Teubner, 1857); Nicetas = Nicetas Eugenianus, Drosilla and Chariclea, in the *Erotici Scriptores*, Edited by Boissonade and others (Paris, Didot, 1856).

The Orphics (Argonautica, *Hymni*, *Fragmenta*) are cited from the edition by E. Abel (Leipzig, 1885). The hymns of Proclus are included in this volume.

²Compare Plato, *Symposium* 197 D, and the fanciful etymologies in Plato, *Cratylus* 410 E. Euripides, *Hippolytus* 525-526, speaks of Eros as distilling *pothos* from his eyes.

Both *Himeros* and *Pothos* share some of the epithets and qualities of *Eros*.

Himeros is bold, all-subduing (A. P. 7.421, N. 34.34), and beautiful (Hesiod, *Theogony* 201). The *Himeroi* are honeyed (A. P. 16.308).

Pothos is unstable (N. 33.112); he 'tempests' lovers with heavy squall (A. P. 12.167); unites lovers (L. M. 2.56); he is the limb-looser (Archilochus, Fragment 85), the city-sacking, the desirable

against the majesty of Love, and Eros dwelt by the flowering garden of Narcissus in Heliconian Thespiae⁹.

Unfortunately we know nothing about the ritual by which Eros was worshipped at Thespiae. It has been conjectured that he was a minor god of fertility in nature, like Priapus and ithyphallic Hermes. Lucian makes Apollo declare that Eros, Hermaphroditus, and Priapus sprang from one mother¹⁰. There is, further, a possibility that Eros had a place in that section of the Demeter myth which deals with Persephone's emergence from the world of the dead¹¹. In art, Loves are shown hovering over the head of a goddess, perhaps Kore, as she rises from the earth¹².

At any rate, Eros at Thespiae presided to some extent over married love. Since strife had arisen between their parents, Plutarch and his newly espoused wife went to Thespiae on the occasion of the Erotidia to perform a sacrifice to Eros. According to Plutarch, one might well advise a woman of virtue to sacrifice to Love that she might keep her husband from running after other women. Persons present at the festival and taking part in it are referred to as members of the dancing and revelling band of the god. We shall probably not go far astray if we suppose that the Erotidia celebrated Eros in all his aspects, and included, at least unofficially, orgies of drinking, dancing, and more disastrous amusements appropriate to a god who presided over fertility in man and in nature¹³.

Praxiteles is said to have made a statue of Eros in Pentelic marble for the people of Thespiae. Later, Lysippus made one of bronze. But the ancient and original symbol of Eros was a crude symbol of unhewn stone, a fact which fits well the character of Eros as a primitive fertility god¹⁴. Leonidas says that the Thespians venerated only the Eros that was sprung from Cytherea, the god whom Praxiteles knew and whose statue he gave to Phryne¹⁵. But it is not probable, I think, that in the devotions of the people the new statue ever displaced the old.

The Praxitelean statue had an interesting history. Phryne asked Praxiteles for the most beautiful of his works. Praxiteles promised to give it to her, but would not reveal which he preferred. Phryne commanded her slave to run to the sculptor and say that his studio was on fire and that most of his work was about to perish. Praxiteles exclaimed that, if the blaze had reached his Satyr and his Eros, all his labor was in vain. Phryne promptly asked for the statue of Eros¹⁶.

In Cicero's day this statue was the only attraction for tourists at Thespiae¹⁷. When Pliny the Elder wrote, it was in the Scholae Octaviae at Rome¹⁸. After having been carried to Rome by Caligula, restored by Claudius, and carried off a second time by Nero, it was destroyed by fire¹⁹.

Eros would seem to have been represented by Prax-

⁹Conon, Narrationes 24; Kaibel, 811.1-3. ¹⁰D. T. 23.1.

¹¹This matter is treated below, in the text.

¹²See W. Fröhner, Les Musées de France, Plate 21 (Paris, 1873).

¹³Erot. 1.22.1, 23.13.

¹⁴Pausanias 9.27.1.

¹⁵A. P. 16.206.

¹⁶Pausanias 1.20.1; A. P. 6.260, 16.203-206; Pseudo-Lucianic

Erotes 11; Athenaeus 13 (591 A).

¹⁷In Verrem 4.2, 60.

¹⁸36.22. ¹⁹Pausanias 9.27.3.

teles as a winged boy with downturned head. In his left hand he grasped a huge bow, which rested on the ground; his right hand was empty, or perhaps contained an arrow. However this may be, the excavating party of Jamot and de Ridder discovered at Thespiae, in 1891, a number of statues of Eros belonging to the Roman period. These show the god of love in a variety of positions, as a naked boy (sometimes with a mantle on his left arm), who stands, sits, crouches, or holds a goose²⁰.

We know, further, that a certain Philinus, son of Mondon and Archela, dedicated an image of Eros and repaired at his own expense the sanctuary and the doors of the *pronaos* at Thespiae. Hadrian dedicated an offering and some original verses to Eros in Thespiae to celebrate his feat in killing a she-bear²¹.

The cult of Eros at Thespiae, then, is well authenticated and its popularity is indicated not only by the celebration of games every fifth year, but by the number of images of the god dedicated there. Less is known about the worship of Eros among the people of Parion in the Hellespont²². Praxiteles is said to have made an image for the temple there as well as for that in Thespiae²³. In Samothrace, Pothos was revered together with Aphrodite²⁴. This fact has led to the conjecture (by A. Furtwängler, in his article Eros, in Roscher's Lexicon der Griechischen und Römischen Mythologie, 1.1342) that Eros (Pothos) belonged to the group of older Pelasgic or Thracian gods who extended their influence to Samothrace and adjacent islands. Of this there is no positive proof. A shrine of Eros at Leuctra on the western coast of Laconia contained so many trees that not even in flood time could the stream which flowed through the sacred grove carry away all the fallen leaves²⁵.

Eros was worshipped not only alone, but also in conjunction with other deities. He appears as an object of veneration along with Aphrodite, Himeros, and Pothos in Megara²⁶. There was a statue of Celestial Eros with Celestial Aphrodite in Smyrna²⁷. Armed Aphrodite was associated with Helios and bow-bearing Eros in her Acrocorinthian temple²⁸.

We hear of the dedication of a statue of Hermes with Aphrodite and the Loves in Carian Aphrodisias²⁹. Eros was venerated with Himeros and Pothos in Athens, and in Elis with the Graces³⁰. Within a chapel in Achaean Aigeira stood a winged Eros alongside Tyche, a statue of Eros which had the horn of Amaltheia, to signify that in Love luck counted for more than beauty³¹. It is noteworthy that Luck was invoked along with Love³².

²⁰B. C. H. 15 (1891), 660.

²¹I. G. 1828, 1830; Kaibel, 811. See Frazer's notes on Pausanias 9.27.1. For victors in the contests at Thespiae see C. I. G. 1429, 1430; I. G. 7.48, 1857, 2517, 2518; P. Jamot, Fouilles de Thespiae: Les Jeux en l'Honneur d'Eros, B. C. H. 19 (1895), 366-374.

²²Pausanias 9.27.1.

²³Pliny, H. N. 36.22.

²⁴Pausanias 3.26.5.

²⁵Pausanias 1.43.6.

²⁶C. I. G. 3157. Compare Plato, Symposium 180 C; Lucian, Encomium on Demosthenes 13. On Pantomime 38; Pseudo-Lucianic Erotes 32, 37.

²⁷Pausanias 2.5.1. For an armed Aphrodite see A. P. 16.173-176; C. I. G. 1444; Plutarch, Institutia Laconica 28, De Fortuna Romanorum 4; Quintilian 2.4.26.

²⁸B.C.H. 9 (1885), 78.

²⁹Harpocration 186, 12; Pausanias 6.24.6.

³⁰Pausanias 7.26.8.

³¹Photius, Bibliotheca 367 B, 15.

Before the entrance to the Academy at Athens was an altar of Eros with an inscription saying that Charmus was the first Athenian to dedicate an altar to this god. There was, also, an altar in Athens to Requited Love (Anteros), set up by foreign residents, for the following reason. A certain Meles commanded his foreign suitor, Timagoras, to throw himself from a rock; in remorse Meles committed suicide; henceforth the foreign residents of Athens worshipped the spirit of Requited Love as the avenger of Timagoras³³.

Philosophers, says Athenaeus, consider Eros a venerable deity, removed from anything discreditable. Evidence is seen in their having set up in gymnasium statues in his honor along with those of Hermes and Hercules. Hermes, of course, typifies eloquence; Hercules presides over valor; Eros presides over the perfect liberty which comes from friendship and harmony. The Athenians, continues Athenaeus, by erecting in the Academy, sacred to Athene, a statue of Eros and sacrificing to it showed they thought that Eros presided over no sensual appetites³⁴. In Elis, too, Eros and Anteros were venerated³⁵.

There was a gymnasium sacred to Eros on the island of Samos, and a festival, the Eleutheria, was celebrated there, doubtless to Love as the god of liberty and harmony in masculine friendship. The Lacedaemonians sacrificed to Love before they went into battle, thinking that safety and victory depended upon the friendship of those who fought side by side³⁶. A similar sacrifice on behalf of the State is attributed to the handsomest men among the Cretans. But perhaps the most notable example of the worship of this manly Eros, who sets courage afire and is ever the strongest of all the gods to exalt the hearts of the foremost in the fight, is presented by the Sacred Band of Thebes, whose members swore to die gloriously with one another rather than live shamefully³⁷.

From brief hints in connection with the cult of Eros and more specifically from the character of Eros as depicted in ancient poetry it is apparent that the Greeks conceived of this god first as a cosmogonic deity, a deity of the power of fertility exhibited in all nature, later (this conception is a quite natural outgrowth of the first, appearing in fact concurrently with it and sometimes inextricably blended with it), as a god who presides over the love of man for man and of man for woman.

The appearance of Eros is variously portrayed, according as he is thought of as a cosmogonic deity or as specifically the god of love. The cosmogonic Eros is a veritable Ancient of Days; the god of love is at first a young man or a boy, then later (particularly in the Alexandrian period) a mischievous child (sometimes without wings—a mere *putto*), though this conception is to some extent anticipated by Alcman, whom Athenaeus calls the first poet of amatory songs;

³³Pausanias 1.30.1. For Anteros see A. P. 16.251.

³⁴See Athenaeus 13.12 (561 D), 13.89 (609 D) for Charmus as an admirer of Hippias and for his lines to 'wily Love'. See also Plutarch, Solon 1.

³⁵Pausanias 6.23.3.

³⁶Athenaeus 561 E-F.

³⁷For the Cretans and the Thebans see Eros. 17; Athenaeus 561 F. For the description of Eros as inspirer of the Sacred Band see A. P. 13.22.

Alcman describes Eros as a roguish boy striding over flowers³⁸.

In Homer the cosmogonic Eros does not appear. Eros is in fact not a god at all in Homer. Aphrodite's *cestus*, which she lends to Hera that she may charm the senses of Zeus, has the qualities of love and yearning and beguilement, which steal away the mind even of the very wise³⁹. Penelope is so divinely beautiful that the limbs of the suitors are loosened⁴⁰ as they gaze upon her and their hearts are enchanted by love⁴¹.

Hesiod, however, represents both the older and the younger Eros as deities. Now Eros is the beautiful looser of limbs who masters the senses of gods and men and follows in the train of Aphrodite, seemingly from the moment of her birth out of the foam⁴². Now he is the primeval, cosmogonic god with lineaments drawn perhaps from the mystic lore of Thespiae (Hesiod is particularly associated with Helicon, near which the Thespian festival took place), or more probably from Orphic world-birth schemes which Hesiod understood but imperfectly. First comes Chaos, then Earth, then Tartarus, then Eros, born without parents⁴³.

According to the Orphics, Phanes, the prototype of Eros, the creator of all things, came out of the mystic world-egg⁴⁴. Orphic in essence is Aristophanes's version of the birth of the birds⁴⁵. First, he says, came Chaos and Darkness and Tartarus. Then came an egg, conceived from a whirlwind and laid by dark-winged Night in the unplumbed depths of the bosom of Darkness. Out of that egg, with the revolving seasons, came Eros the desirable, with wings of gold glittering on his back. Love in turn, mingling with dark Chaos in wide Tartarus, hatched the birds and brought them up to light as his first fruits. Until Eros mingled with the universe there was no race of immortals⁴⁶.

Night and Chaos were followed by Eros, according to the comic poet Antiphanes⁴⁷. Chaos, Earth, and Eros rose in succession, as Acusilaus phrased it⁴⁸. Eros was 'devised' ('contrived', 'planned') by Birth, Parmenides declared⁴⁹, or by Aphrodite⁵⁰ (the subject of the verb in Parmenides's verses is uncertain); he was created, said Parmenides, before all other gods. He

³⁸Fragment 29 (Bergk); Athenaeus 13.75 (600 F).

³⁹Iliad 16.216-217.

⁴⁰For Eros as the 'limb-looser' compare Sappho, Fragment 40; Carmina Popularia 32 (Bergk); Hesiod, Theogony 120. Archilochus (Fragment 85) uses this epithet of Pothos.

⁴¹Odyssey 18.212-213.

⁴²Theogony 64, 120, 201. Himeros, apparently thought of as Eros's brother, lives with the Graces on the top of Mt. Olympus. Pothos likewise accompanies the Graces (Euripides, Bacchae 414). He is the companion of Wisdom, the Ambrosial Graces, and Quiet (Aristophanes, Birds 1320-1321). For Eros himself on the top of Olympus compare A. R. 3.113; N. 33.36.

⁴³Theogony 116.

⁴⁴Compare Damascius, Quaestiones De Primiis Principiis (page 380 in the edition by J. Kopp [Frankfurt, 1826]); Epimenides, Fragment 5 (see Hermann Diels, Die Fragmente der Vorsokratiker, 1.190 [Berlin, Weidmann, 1912]). On Berlin Vase 2430 Eros is shown emerging from an egg (see A. Furtwängler, Beschreibung der Vasensammlung im Antiquarium, 2.676 [Berlin, W. Spemann, 1885]).

⁴⁵In Pseudo-Lucianic Philopatris 13 this passage of the Birds is quoted in part, and the credit for creation is given to Divine Light instead of to Eros.

⁴⁶Cited by Ireneaus, Against Heresies 2.17 (page 308, in Stieren's edition [Leipzig, 1851-1853]).

⁴⁷Plato, Symposium 178 B.

⁴⁸According to Plato, Symposium 178 B.

⁴⁹Plutarch less plausibly gives this interpretation in Eros. 13.11. For other interpretations of Parmenides's verses see Stobaeus, Eclogue, 1.482 (in the edition of C. Wachsmuth and O. Hense [Berlin, 1884]), and Simplicius, In Aristotelis Physica Commentaria, Folio 9a (in the edition of H. Diels [Berlin, 1892-1895]).

was born of Chaos, Ibucus asserted⁵¹; he was the son of Night and Aether, according to Acusilaus⁵².

Eldest born among the blessed gods, Eros arose from unsmiling Chaos with fierce and flaming torch and first established the ordinances of wedded love and ordered the rites of the marriage bed⁵³. He was born when Necessity still ruled and all creeping things and birds were subject to the decrees of Earth; he is Lord of the broad-breasted Earth; he is called the swift-flying son of Chaos, not of Cypris or of Ares, for he ruled not by force, but by gentle-voiced persuasion; yet even so he robbed earth and sea and heaven of their immemorial scepter and gave laws to the gods⁵⁴. Eros is, then, not a newcomer in religion, like the effeminate Attises and Adonises; one might as well call into question the divinity of Zeus as that of Eros⁵⁵.

Usually cosmogonic Eros is called 'old' or is characterized by an equivalent epithet to distinguish him from the sportive, cruel god who presides over amorous affairs. But sometimes, as we have noted, the two conceptions are inextricably interwoven; indeed, a writer occasionally gives Eros a double origin to make certainty more sure⁵⁶. Though a boy, foolish and beardless in appearance⁵⁷, Eros is truly venerable, an old man who was a child before Cronus; he is older even than Cronus and the whole expanse of Time. He is ancient and great, equal in age to the gods that have always existed, the father of primeval ages. His voice is not that of a bird or a boy, but that of a greybeard, high and piping⁵⁸.

The author of the *Erotes*, a dialogue on the various kinds of love, attributed to Lucian, draws the sharpest distinction between the two. The one is a celestial divinity, hierophant of mysteries, not the roguish child sportively depicted by the hands of artists, but the serious deity on whom one may call to stand by him, the being whom 'first-sowing Beginning' generated, perfect from the outset, the Eros who from obscure and confused formlessness formed the whole, that Eros who is a divine and inspiring sight and gives us pleasure mixed with virtue. The other Eros has childish thoughts, cannot be controlled by reason, and desire for women is his chief concern⁵⁹.

In his more sober and earlier aspect, then, Eros is a creator. He has power over all nature, not over men alone. Into this Eros Zeus changed himself to do a creator's work⁶⁰. Being highest of all the gods, Eros has in fact more power than Zeus; he is master of the elements, of the stars, and of gods like himself; he has power over plant, iron, stone, not over men only; the

⁵¹ See the Argument to Theocritus, Idyll 13.

⁵² Oppian, Halieutica 4.23.

⁵³ See Simias's pattern poem, *Wings of Love*, in A. P. 15.24. In *Orphic Argonautica* 14, Eros is called the renowned son of Night.

⁵⁴ Eros, 1.3-5-6.

⁵⁵ Oppian, as cited in note 53, above. Compare Pausanias 9.27.2.

⁵⁶ Simias, in A.P. 15.24 (compare note 54, above), gives Eros a heavy beard.

⁵⁷ For other epithets and descriptions of Eros compare D. T. 2; *Orphic Argonautica* 424; Nicetas 3. 114; G. G. 1.65; Longus, *Daphnis* and *Chloe* 2.5; Plato, *Symposium* 177 A; Scholiast on Hesiod, *Theogony* 115; Menander, *On Encomium* 9 (in Spengel, *Rhetores Graeci*, 3. 343); Lucian, *On Pantomime* 7, 38; *Pseudo-Lucianic Erotes* 32, 37; Xenophon, *Symposium* 8.1.

⁵⁸ *Erotes* 32, 37.

⁵⁹ Pherecydes of Syros, according to Proclus's commentary on Plato, *Timaeus* (page 368, in C. E. Chr. Schneider's edition [Breslau, 1847]).

flowers and all the plants are his creation; by reason of his power rivers run and winds blow; he has the keys to all things in heaven, earth, sea, and Tartarus⁶¹.

From the *philotes* of Empedocles, which, according to Plutarch, is Eros⁶², arose the sphere. Now, as is well known, in the Empedoclean system Love reconciled the elements in the universe, while Strife drew them apart. Leaping the gulf of nearly ten centuries, we find Eros playing the rôle of life-giver and reconciler in Nonnus's *Dionysiaca*⁶³. Here Eros is the 'first-generated beginning of generation', 'the life-giving charioteer of the harmony of the world'. His very bow and flute are life-supporting, and his weapons are fruitful. He ploughs the furrow of the universe, and sows it with a mixture of male and female seed. Life-bringer, coeval with the world, hope of all life, he 'sows marriage'. When Love, no longer honored, relaxes his fiery bow, the furrow of the world is loveless and childless; when wise, self-taught Love, who governs this world, refuses to open up the gloomy doors of firstborn Chaos and take out his 'arrow-case of mutual mortal nuptials', creation is doomed.

Eros manifests his power over nature in manifold fashion. When the earth blossoms with spring flowers, then lovely Love appears bearing seed to men⁶⁴. Unarmed Eros appears in art, smiling gently and having a dolphin and a flower in his hands, for in the one hand he holds the earth, in the other the sea⁶⁵. Ox-driver's goad in hand, the boy sows the furrow with seed from a bag on his shoulder⁶⁶; he is a country-bred Love who furthers the gardener's labor, not a gay reveller from the city⁶⁷. All nature obeys him: fish come more speedily to the catch when they are mating⁶⁸. The lions of Cybele allow him to grasp their manes and ride on their backs; with impunity Eros puts his hand into their mouths⁶⁹. On a signet ring Love drives lions to a chariot, masterfully holding the whip and the reins⁷⁰.

Thus much is to be said about Eros the creator, the author of harmony who yields his scepter over growing things, and brute beasts, and men.

Love is not only called the son of Zeus—with this we come more directly to the parentage of Eros; he handles the weapons of Zeus and of the other gods. Alcibiades had on his shield an Eros with a thunderbolt; Eros uses the flaming brands of Zeus in the fight against the monster Typhoeus; the poet Asclepiades begs the Loves, for the sake of the gods, to let him rest

⁶⁰ Nicetas 4. 135-136; Longus 2.7; *Orphic Hymn* 58.1; Euripides, *Hippolytus* 534, and Fragments 136, 269 (in A. Nauck, *Tragorum Graecorum Fragmenta* [Leipzig, 1889]). Compare the description of Isis, who is also the Celestial Paphian Venus, in Apuleius, *Metamorphoses* 11.2, 25. See Euripides, Fragment 898, Aeschylus, Fragment 44 (Nauck), for Aphrodite and Eros as causes of rain and fertility on earth. The notion here presented of the wedding of Heaven and Earth may have played some part in the ritual of the deity Eros. ⁶¹ Eros, 13.6.

⁶² The rôle of Eros in this chaotic, exotic, and erotic epic is at once bewildering and fascinating. The general impression made on one who comes to it for the first time is that the author memorized the whole of Homer, conned a number of dictionaries of mythology, and then sustained a horrible nightmare during which he talked in his sleep. Nevertheless the poem is worth reading if only for its picture of Eros and the tantalizing hints which it gives of the love god's ritual. See 2.221, 7.1, 110, 192, 24.217, 268, 33.109, 40.402-403, 41.128-142, 408. For Eros as reconciler compare also Plato, *Symposium* 197 C-D. ⁶³ Theognis 1275-1278.

⁶⁴ A.P. 16.207.

⁶⁵ A.P. 16.200. ⁶⁶ A.P. 16.202.

⁶⁷ Oppian, Halieutica, Book 4, *passim*. Nothing could be drollier than Oppian's solemn use of the *sermo amatarius* in connection with the various finny tribes.

⁶⁸ D.T. 12.

⁶⁹ A.P. 9.221.

or to render him ashes and cinders with thunderbolts; winged Eros breaks a thunderbolt; and, finally, in art, the Loves are represented with the tambourine and the thyrsus of Bacchus, the shield and the plumed helmet of Ares, the quiver and the arrows of Phoebus, the club of Hercules, the trident of Poseidon, and the thunderbolt of Zeus, which with Aphrodite's aid they have pilfered from the deities in question⁷¹.

Accounts of the parentage of Eros are varied. He is called the child of Chaos and the primal nature of things, of Night and Aether, and of Zeus⁷². He is also the child of Earth and Heaven⁷³, of Hermes and Artemis (evidently the ithyphallic Hermes and the Chthonian Artemis, the daughter of Zeus and Persephone⁷⁴). Olen of Lycia, author of theoldest Greek hymns, declared that Eros was the youngest of the gods and the son of Eilithyia; older than Cronus, he was to be identified with Fate⁷⁵.

Again, Eros is that most dreadful of the gods whom fair-sandalled Iris bore to Zephyr of the golden hair⁷⁶. Iris, who assists women in childbirth, is addressed as the mother of Eros⁷⁷. Both Sappho and Ibucus liken the effect of Love to that of a rushing, mighty wind.

Other descriptions of the parentage of Eros bring out, not his impetuosity and his antiquity, but rather his cruelty and his ingenuity. Madness, a she-bear, or a lioness suckled him; he was reared in a forest⁷⁸. He is in a mean between fair and foul, good and evil, and not a god at all, but only a great intermediate power or daemon, who conveys to the gods the prayers of men and to men the commands of the gods. Son of Poverty and Plenty, conceived at the birthday feast of Aphrodite when his mother came begging at the doors and his father was drunk on nectar, Eros partakes of the nature of both parents: he is full and starved by turns; like his mother he is poor and squalid, lying on mats at doorways, like his father he is bold and strong, and full of arts and resources⁷⁹.

But the conventional account makes him the son of Aphrodite alone, or of Aphrodite and another deity. Of Aphrodite, baneful daughter of the foam, of Cyprus, the Cyprian-born, the Paphian, Cytherea, i.e. the love goddess under her various names, Eros is said to have been born⁸⁰. It is a wonder, Meleager declares, that Cyprus when she rose from the green sea brought fire out of water⁸¹. Nonnus describes how Eros was born

⁷¹Euripides, Hippolytus 534; Athenaeus 12.47 (534 E); Plutarch, Alcibiades 16; N. 1.403; A.P. 12.166, 16.214-215, 250.

⁷²Compare Servius on Aeneid 1.664.

⁷³Sappho, according to the scholiast on A. R. 3.26.

⁷⁴Cicero, De Natura Deorum 3.60.

⁷⁵Pausanias 9.27.2. After Olen, Pamphus and Orpheus wrote hymns for the Lycomidae to use in their worship of Eros in the deme of Phyla. For Olen compare also Pausanias 8.21.3; Herodotus 4.35.

⁷⁶Cited in Erot. 20, as an instance of poets taking Love seriously. Eros was the child of the giant Zephyr, according to the mythmakers, as Eurytus, the melic poet of Lacedaemon, said, according to Lydus, De Mensibus (page 117 in the edition by R. Wünsch [Teubner, Leipzig, 1898]); compare Alcaeus, Fragment 13.

⁷⁷N. 31. 111; 47.342.

⁷⁸Theognis 1231; Theocritus 3.15; Nicetas 2.88, 6.378.

⁷⁹Plato, Symposium 201.

⁸⁰Sappho, Fragment 117; C. S. 2.23, 82, 47.101; Nicetas 3.281, 4.157, 313, 6.599; Kaibel, 810; N. 4.239, 33.97, 41.405; A. P. 9.440, 623, 784, 12.54, 56, 86, 16.205, 210, 211, 252; C. S. 2.23, 47.101; N. 33.97; Melitenotes, in Miller, Notices et Extraits des MSS Paris, 19, Part 2, pages 1-138 (Paris, 1858); Anacreon 42.9; Theodorus Prodromus 2.422. ⁸¹A.P. 5.176.

near Beroe, leaping untimely from the womb of the goddess shortly after her emergence from the sea⁸². On an ancient discus Eros was shown carried laughing over the silver waves by dancing dolphins, along with Aphrodite, who was coming from the ocean⁸³. The Loves, too, are called Cyprian and Aphrodisian⁸⁴.

Other poets were unwilling to leave Aphrodite unassisted in the production of cruel Eros. Various collaborators are mentioned: crafty Ares⁸⁵, Heaven⁸⁶, and Hermes⁸⁷.

Oppian is frankly doubtful as to the parentage of Eros: 'whether', he says, 'thou art eldest born, or Aphrodite of many counsels, Queen of Paphos, bare thee, be thou gracious and come to us gently and with fair weather'⁸⁸. Theocritus says: 'Of whatsoever one of the gods Eros was the child, he was not born for us alone'⁸⁹. Meleager admits that Aphrodite is the mother of Eros and that his grandmother is the Sea, but he says that Eros's father has no name or pedigree⁹⁰. It is only fair, so Palladas asserts, that a blacksmith (Hephaestus) who owns a son named Eros and a wife called Aphrodite should have a lame leg⁹¹.

Many of the havens or refuges of Eros are associated with the places of his birth. Such are Beroe, Cyprus, and Paphos⁹². Love comes from Cyprus in the spring-time⁹³. Desire-smitten Orchomenus is a dance-beaten precinct of the Loves who celebrate victory⁹⁴. Athens, lovely land, is the home of the Loves, and Macedonia is the abode of Pothos⁹⁵. The Loves, too, are termed Cydonian⁹⁶.

The most exquisite description of Eros's appearance is given by Longus⁹⁷. The old man Philetas comes into his garden about noon and finds there a boy under pomegranates and myrtles with myrtles and pomegranates in his hands. He is white as milk and yellow as fire, gleaming as if newly bathed. Naked and alone, he sports as if plucking the fruit of his own garden. When pursued, he runs as swiftly as the young of a partridge, taking refuge under roses and poppies. Though he goes so swiftly and plays so ardently, he breaks no flower, injures no vine, muddies no spring in which he splashes. In seeming he is a boy, but he has the voice, not of a nightingale or swallow or swan, but of an old man. For all his age he is merry and sprightly. He laughs aloud. He leaps up like the young of a nightingale upon the myrtles. Philetas catches a glimpse of wings and the bow on his shoulders, and then sees no more.

Descriptions in other authors corroborate and expand this lovely picture. Eros is small⁹⁸. 'Do not revile small things', says a bath; 'I, like Eros, am little'⁹⁹.

⁸²N. 41.129.

⁸³Anacreon 56.

⁸⁴N. 1.351, 33.335, 42.137; Pindar, Fragment 105. Simonides of Ceos, Fragment 43. Eros-Anteros was son of Mars and the third Venus, that is the daughter of Zeus and Dione, who was wife of Hephaestus. Compare Cicero, De Natura Deorum 3.60; Servius on Aeneid 1.664.

⁸⁵Thus Sappho, according to the Argument to Theocritus 13. Pausanias (9.27.3) says Sappho gave many conflicting descriptions of Love.

⁸⁶Cicero, De Natura Deorum 3.60.

⁸⁷Haliætica 4, ad initium. ⁸⁸I.3.1-2.

⁸⁹A.P. 5.177, 180. ⁹⁰A.P. 11.307.

⁹¹N. 13.435, 436, 41.14. ⁹²Theognis 1275.

⁹²N. 13.95, 48.281. ⁹³Euripides, Medea 842.

⁹³N. 48.969. ⁹⁴Daphnis and Chloe 2.3-6.

⁹⁴N. 1.50, 4.241, 7.271, 42.184; Fragmentum Adespotum 170, in Theodor Kock, Comicorum Atticorum Fragmenta 3.441 (Leipzig, Teubner, 1888); Theocritus 19. ⁹⁵A.P. 9.784.

Love is not big, but beautiful, like a flowering garden¹⁰⁰. His little hands are swift to shoot and can reach as far as Acheron and Hades¹⁰¹. The silvery shoulders on which he carries his weapons are slight¹⁰². His wings are little and he has the slightest of weapons¹⁰³. At times he is naked; at other times he wears a delicate tunic¹⁰⁴. His face is ruddy, fiery red; he is like rosy apples; his lovely complexion indicates that he dwells among flowers¹⁰⁵. A sweet blush is glowing on the bloom of his cheeks¹⁰⁶. His face is sweet and calm, yet pert¹⁰⁷. He has dainty lips, a snub nose, lovely flaming eyes, and plentiful, delicate golden hair, surmounted by a heavily-flowered miter¹⁰⁸.

Fairest of the gods, all lovely, Eros resembles a beautiful statue¹⁰⁹. Shapely and graceful, a delicate youth, with soft sandals he goes, as Ate goes, on soft things; it takes a Homer to describe him; he does not walk on earth or on our craniums; he prefers soft hearts and rebounds from the hard¹¹⁰. He is pliant; he folds himself about our hearts and steals into them secretly¹¹¹. Resplendent and gleaming with ungualts, he possesses abundantly the natural bloom of grace¹¹².

Being a god, Eros is quite naturally and quite early endowed with wings: he comes (flying?) from Heaven in a 'purple' cloak¹¹³. High-suspended traveller in air who flaps his pinions everywhere throughout the world, who on circling wings can lightly mount and as lightly leap down from Olympus as he shakes his feathers, Love goes on high-raised sandal with wind-swift foot above the clouds; his swiftly-flapping wings give forth the roar of the winds as he whizzes along¹¹⁴. Even at birth the swift-footed boy, whirling light pinions, leapt up swiftly into his mother's gleaming arms¹¹⁵.

Himself equipped with beautiful golden wings that glitter on his back, Love lends wings to the souls, nay even the bodies, of others¹¹⁶. When the lover hears that his beloved has arrived, he flies swiftly from Smyrna to Sardis; if they were racing him, even Zetes and Calais would be left behind¹¹⁷. Eros will transport the lover to the object of his passion, though she go to the uttermost parts of the world¹¹⁸.

Ever in the lover's ears is the noise of Love's wings, those wings outstretched that show the way to desire,

¹⁰⁰A.P. 9.666. ¹⁰¹A.P. 9.440.14, 16.195.
¹⁰²A.P. 12.77; N. 33.181. ¹⁰³A.P. 5.178; N. 7.270.

¹⁰⁴N. 7.275. ¹⁰⁵48.107; A.P. 9.440. 16.207.

¹⁰⁶A.P. 12.97; Orphic Argonautica 14; A.P. 16.210; Theocritus 7.

¹⁰⁷Plato, Symposium 196 A. ¹⁰⁸A.R. 3.121.

¹⁰⁹A.P. 9.440. 16.197; N. 48.614.

¹¹⁰A.P. 5.178, 179, 9.440. 12.55, 16.210; N. 13.456; Euripides, Iphigenia in Aulis 594; Anacreon, Fragment 14, and Fragment 65. 1-3.

¹¹¹Plato, Symposium 195 A; D.T. 23.1; Hesiod, Theogony 120; A.P. 5.140, 12.56; Longus 2.7; Lydus, De Mensibus, page 117 (see note 76, above).

¹¹²A.P. 12.78; Anacreon, Fragment 65; Orphic Fragments 58, 69; A.P. 9.443, 12.158; Plato, Symposium 196 A, 195 C-E; Homer, Iliad 10.83.

¹¹³Plato, Symposium 196 A; A.R. 3.296; Oppian, Halieutica 4.2.

¹¹⁴Anacreon, Fragment 13; Aristophanes, Birds 697; A.P. 9.221.

¹¹⁵Sappho, Fragment 64.

¹¹⁶N. 33.58, 184. 42.1, 47.267, 48.471-479, 614.

¹¹⁷N. 41.129.

¹¹⁸Anacreon, Fragment 25; Euripides, Hippolytus 1270-1275;

Aristophanes, Birds 697; Eubulus, Fragment 41 (Kock); Orphic Hymn 58.1; Proclus, Hymn 2.3 (in Abel's edition); Kaibel, 1103; G.G. 4.9; A.P. 5.177, 6.260, 12.75, 111, 113, 16.195; A.N. 7.36; Erot. 3. 4; Longus 2.3, 7; Oppian, Halieutica 4. 27; N. 5.112, 13. 435, 32.52, 33.71; Nicetas 3.139, 5.44, 1.35, 8.103; Plato, Phaedrus 249, 255 D. ¹¹⁹A.P. 12.202.

¹²⁰A.P. 5.301; Anacreon, Fragment 24.

the pinions of Eros, who has the strength to fly *to us*, but not *away from us*¹¹⁹. Some wise men dissent from the common opinion and say that wings belong not to Love but to lovers¹²⁰. The painter or worker in wax who first fashioned Eros with wings was fit, we read, to draw only swallows; densely ignorant of Love's ways, he did not realize that this deity, far from being light or easily shaken off, is altogether heavy¹²¹. Winged Eros proves one labor too heavy and difficult for Hercules; the giant's weapons are lost in the struggle¹²². Love, the flying hunter, drags his catch to the beloved's doors and writes thereon, 'These are spoils taken from Chastity'¹²³.

No one on foot can escape a winged creature who comes so hot on the trail¹²⁴. The poet dreams that he has wings, yet Love even with fetters of lead on his beautiful feet overtakes the quarry; with hyacinthine wand he lashes his victim on to run through bush and brier and mountain torrent and ravine, until, at last, he cools him, exhausted, with the fanning of soft wings¹²⁵. Let the poet declare in lofty vein that the soul has wings with which to fly from Love if he burns her too often¹²⁶: the wise know that even casual experimentation with the feathered rogue is dangerous. Catch him on a bed of roses, take him by the wings, dip him in wine and drink the mixture down: from that time forth Love's feathers inside your limbs will tickle abominably¹²⁷.

Swifter than hawk or eagle or any other winged thing, Eros himself is a bastard bird, in flight like a swan¹²⁸. Like a vulture he perches on the vitals of a man or a woman, then on those of another¹²⁹. He builds his nest in a lover's heart and the young Loves hatch out there¹³⁰. A little Love flies away from its mother's nest; it is still easy to catch, since it is not trying to escape, but is dwelling in the house of the beautiful Damis¹³¹. After the fashion of nightingales the young Loves flit about among the branches of the trees above Aphrodite and Adonis¹³².

The swiftly-flapping wings of Eros give forth the roar of the winds; the god himself, whirling desire and lightning of burning longing, descends like a tempest¹³³. He tosses the very gods with the fury of desire, as if on a stormy sea¹³⁴. He shakes the lover as a mountain wind falling on the oaks shakes them¹³⁵. He enters the soul like a squall with a hurricane of sheer misery and anguish; boisterous Love is a veritable Harpy, the personified spirit of the hurricane¹³⁶.

Love is like a rushing winter torrent, like a stormy sea. The poet, tossed on the heavy gale of desire, swims in a Pamphylian ocean of love; he sails on the sea of Cyprus, who is his skipper, while Eros keeps the tiller, holding in his hand the end of the soul's rudder, as

¹¹⁹A.P. 5.212.

¹²⁰Alexis, according to Athenaeus 13.13 (562 D).

¹²¹Eubulus, or Ararus, according to Athenaeus, *ibidem*.

¹²²A.P. 16.103. ¹²³A.P. 12.23. ¹²⁴A.P. 5.59.

¹²⁵Anacreon 28-29. ¹²⁶A.P. 5.57.

¹²⁷Anacreon 5; Plato, Phaedrus 251 C.

¹²⁸Longus 2.4, N. 2.219-220, 42.37.

¹²⁹A.P. 9.440. ¹³⁰Anacreon 25.

¹³¹A.P. 12.105. ¹³²Theocritus 15.120.

¹³³A.P. 12.87-88. ¹³⁴A.P. 16.196.

¹³⁵Sappho, Fragment 42; Erot. 16.21.

¹³⁶Oppian, Halieutica 4.12; Ibucus, Fragment 1; A.P. 5.268, 293;

Parthenon, Fragment 10; A. Meineke, *Analecta Alexandrina* 266

(Berlin, 1843); *Etymologicum Magnum* 148.33; Hesychius, under *Harpy*.

the boat plunges about in the bitter waves of Love; the poet's only hope and prayer is that Eros may receive him into a sheltering harbor¹³⁷. Zeus, helmsman of gods and men, is a pupil of love¹³⁸. It is natural that Eros should be a sailor and take to a seafaring life: he is the son of Aphrodite of the waves¹³⁹. Sometimes the Loves are a ship's lading and Aphrodite is the merchant¹⁴⁰. Changeable as ocean are the moods of Love and of the beloved. His grandmother, the Sea, roars when beaten by the winds; Eros, like the waves, is prone to anger¹⁴¹. The stern cables of the lover's life are fastened to the beloved: a clouded glance brings wintry storm to the shipwrecked sailor on Love's sea, a bright glance brings blooming spring¹⁴². Nor does danger wait only on the sea. The traveller sets foot on land, congratulating himself that on his first voyage he has escaped sea and pirates: out leaps violent Love and drags his victim into fresh peril¹⁴³.

(To be continued)

WASHINGTON SQUARE COLLEGE,
NEW YORK

FLOYD A. SPENCER

PROFESSOR GILDERSLEEVE ON CORY'S VERSION OF CALLIMACHUS

Still are thy pleasant voices, thy nightingales, awake,
For Death, he taketh all away, but them he cannot
take.

These are the concluding verses (correctly given) of one of the best known and best loved poems in the English language, whatever the Greeks thought of the epigram of Callimachus that suggested them. It is therefore surprising to find them misquoted¹ in one of the passages from Gildersleeve's Brief Mention given by Professor Lodge in his interesting review of that work (*THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY* 25.97-99). It seems incredible that a person of Gildersleeve's correct ear and feeling for language could have substituted "verses", equally bad in sound and in sense², for "voices". I would rather think that the first printer misread Gildersleeve's manuscript, especially as there are other misprints ("I" for "to" in the second verse, "these" for "them" in the last verse), and that somehow the error escaped correction by all succeeding hands. The material for emendation is supplied by the schoolboy version, given later by Gildersleeve himself, *Muta silet vox ista placens....*

But, if the supposition of a printer's error can account for the misquotation of the poem, it is difficult to find an explanation of "verses" repeated twice in Gildersleeve's paragraph of "detailed criticism". He does not say what he thinks the verses mean, but his own version of Callimachus's poem, given elsewhere, "Yet live thy Nightingales...", could be interpreted like Cory's "Still are thy pleasant voices, thy nightin-

¹³⁷Oppian, Halieutica 4.19.

¹³⁸A.P. 5.190, 12.156-157, 167; Plato, Symposium 197 B; N. 33.50.

¹³⁹N. 4.239.

¹⁴⁰N. 3.116. ¹⁴¹A.P. 5.180. ¹⁴²A.P. 12.156, 159.

¹⁴³A.P. 12.84-85.

<¹As one would expect, the passage appears in the volume edited by Professor Miller exactly as it appeared in *The American Journal of Philology* 33 (1912), 486-487. C. K. >

*The Poems of John Keats, Edited by E. de Sélincourt³ (London, Methuen, 1926).

gales, awake..." And Cory's thought at any rate is the same as Keats's:

Thou wast not born for death, immortal Bird!
No hungry generations tread thee down.
The voice I hear this passing night was heard
In ancient days by emperor and clown:
Perhaps the self-same song that found a path
Through the sad heart of Ruth, when, sick for
home,
She stood in tears amid the alien corn;
The same that oft-times hath
Charm'd magic casements, opening on the foam
Of perilous seas, in faery lands forlorn.

On this Professor de Sélincourt, in his edition of Keats⁴ (Introduction, lx), remarks, "in the song of the bird he detects, for the time at least, a symbol of the beauty for which there is no death nor change". It is the felicitous expression of this idea which has made Cory's poem immortal.

It must freely be admitted that it is by no means certain that this is what Callimachus meant when he wrote *αι δε τελ ξωνοις αγησονες*, which the Budé editor⁴ translates by "Mais ils vivent, les chants de ros-signol", so that for him 'verses' would do. If Callimachus meant that, his prophecy is unfulfilled, as this Heraclitus is otherwise unknown. Apart from the beauty of the language, the last two verses have little value, as they are not true, whereas Cory's nightingales are "a symbol of the beauty for which there is no death..."

This is the heart of the matter, and it is perhaps not worth while to take up the rest of Gildersleeve's somewhat carping criticisms of the poem, except one, "...Carian is a poor substitute for Halicarnassian..." Just try 'Halicarnassian' on Cory's poem, or, perhaps better, try to read aloud the line in Gildersleeve's own translation in which he uses the word.

It seems to me that the great scholar was nodding here, but I am second to none in my admiration for him, and I should like to end with a sentence from him (cited by Professor Lodge: see page 98, column 2) which deserves frequent repetition in this day and generation: "...One comes away from the best translation, thankful that he can read the original if only after a fashion..."

BARNARD COLLEGE

GERTRUDE HIRST

CLASSICAL ARTICLES IN NON-CLASSICAL PERIODICALS

V

Modern Language Notes—December, Review, generally favorable, by J. H. Hanford, of Walter MacKellar, *The Latin Poems of John Milton*; Review, generally favorable, by W. P. Mustard, of F. A. Wright and T. A. Sinclair, *A History of Later Latin Literature*.

Modern Philology—November, Pope on the Translators of Homer, Austin Warren.

<²I find myself unable to agree here with my colleague. C. K. >

*Callimaque, Par Emile Cahen (Paris, 1922).

Nation—November 25, Review, favorable, anonymous, of John Sparrow, *Half-Lines and Repetitions in Virgil*; December 2, Review, generally favorable, anonymous, of Naomi Mitchison, *The Corn King and the Spring Queen*.

New Republic, The—November 11, Review, generally favorable, by John Cournos, of Naomi Mitchison, *The Corn King and the Spring Queen*; December 16, Review, favorable, by Rolfe Humphries, of Auguste Couat, *Alexandrian Poetry under the First Three Ptolemies* (translated by James Loeb); January 13, Review, generally favorable, anonymous, of Grant Showerman, *Rome and the Romans*.

Nineteenth Century and After—January, Hannibal in the Alps, Spenser Wilkinson [in opposition to a statement made in *The Cambridge Ancient History*, Volume VIII, the writer asserts: "The accounts of Livy and Polybius <concerning Hannibal's crossing of the Alps> do not conflict; they tell precisely the same story, though Livy, in one passage, gives details not found in Polybius but in no way inconsistent with the itinerary upon which both writers are agreed.... the language of Polybius is so precise as to leave no possible doubt as to the identity of the points intended. To begin with, the description of the pass—which the Cambridge historian regards as an absurd story—indicates with certainty the Col Clapier, for that is the one pass in the Western Alps from the summit of which there is a clear view of a great sweep of the plain of Piedmont.... Polybius fixes the starting-point and the end of the route from the Rhone to Italy. He describes the Rhone valley as a corridor.... He then explains that Hannibal marched from Fourques about 154 miles up this corridor and reached the point which he calls 'the ascent of the Alps', and that from that point he marched 132 miles to the plain near Turin. These measurements fix the 'ascent of the Alps' at the point where the Isère issues from the mountains into the Rhone valley at the Bec d'Échaillon, from which the only way to the Col Clapier is by the Isère and its tributary the Arc." A sketch map of Hannibal's route accompanies the article. <For the last discussion, in *THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY*, of Hannibal's route see 23.133-134. C. K.>].

Nuova Antologia (Rome)—November 1, *Archeologia*, G. Q. Giglioli; December 1, *L'Olivicoltura*, Giacomo Acerbo,

Revue d'Histoire Littéraire de la France—April-June, Baudelaire, Sénèque et Saint Jean Chrysostome, G. T. Clapton.

Revue des Cours et Conférences—December 15, *Esthétique et Critique Littéraire chez les Grecs* (IV): Platon, A. Puech [Platon et Homère—La Réglementation Morale de la Poésie et de la Musique]; December 30, *Esthétique et Critique Littéraire chez les Grecs* (V): Aristote, A. Puech [Aristote: Théorie Générale du Beau et de l'Art]; January 15, Lessing et Corneille, *Interprètes d'Aristote* (II), E. Tonnelat; *Esthétique et Critique Littéraire chez les Grecs* (VI): Aristote, A. Puech [Aristote: La Poétique—La

Tragédie]; *Les Rythmes de Timbres dans la Poésie Grecque*, Pius Servien.

Revue Historique—September-October, Les Prétextes Juridiques de la Troisième Guerre Punique (suite et fin), Charles Saumagne [III. A. La Replique des Vaincus et la Version d'Appien; B. Le Second Prétexte: Infraction à la "Deditio"; C. Les Prétextes et L'Opinion Romaine]; Sur la Date d'une Loi de Gratien contre L'Hérésie, Jean-Remy Palanque [an emendation of Codex Theodosianus 16.5.4].

Saturday Review of Literature—November 7, Review, generally favorable, anonymous, of J. W. Mackail, *The Aeneid* <for this book see *THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY* 25.99-101. C. K.>; January 9, Review, favorable, by H. T. Costello, of B. A. G. Fuller, *History of Greek Philosophy* (three volumes).

School and Society—November 14, Humanity Reinforced, Richard M. Gummere ["The civic-social system of study which men like Professors Rugg and Goodwin Watson advocate is very good; but it must be based on knowledge of the past. Otherwise, there will be still less of a policy in our democracy twenty years from now.... For such a reason the French and Latin and Algebra and science must be retained, modified and improved in order to turn out persons who can think their way through their problems"]; December 5, Review, favorable to the author, but hostile to the subject, of Gaston Delayen, *Cicero*; Review, favorable, of W. J. Woodhouse, *The Fight for an Empire* [translation of Tacitus, Histories, Book 3]; December 26, Wanted: A Moral Equivalent for the Classics, J. S. Cleland ["It is better to require year after year of the ancient languages than to turn out of our schools slovenly thinkers and moral slackers; and, whatever else is believed about the possibility of the transfer of mental training, there is but little doubt that from the faithful study of the classics there came certain moral values, such as the habit of thorough work"]; January 9, The Educational Changes in <Modern> Greece, Joseph S. Roucek.

School Review—December, Review, favorable, by F. F. Powers, of H. R. Huse, *The Psychology of Foreign Language Study*.

Scientia—December, Die Naturwissenschaft der Peripatetiker, O. Regenbogen; Etica e Diritto nel Mondo Classico Latino, E. Albertario.

Scientific American—November, Rome's Splendid Pantheon Restored [full-page illustration]; From the Archaeologist's Note Book [An Etruscan Safety Pin; Eastern Stucco Statues; Excavating Rome's Seaport. Five photographic illustrations accompany the text]; December, From the Archaeologist's Note Book [Masterpiece of Minoan Art; Babylonian Brick Reliefs; A Link Between Hellenistic and Roman Painting. Five photographic illustrations accompany the text]; January, From the Archaeologist's Note Book [Curious Lead Tablet; Luristan Bronzes; A Benevolent Hippopotamus; A Street of the Ages <at Paestum>. Five photographic illustrations accompany the text].



***Latin is interesting—
Why not make it so?***

THE CLIMAX SERIES makes Latin interesting in the truest sense. Here are examples. In **LATIN—FIRST YEAR** (Magoffin and Henry) more than thirty of the paintings of Forti are reproduced to give the beginning student a clearer picture of ancient Roman life as described in the Latin stories. In **LATIN—SECOND YEAR** (Berry and Lee) remarkable pictures and English quotations lead the student to realize that real people took part in the Gallic wars. In **LATIN—FOURTH YEAR** (Burton and Gummere) students' reading of the Latin poetry is enlivened by literary notes which reveal the connection and kinship between Latin and English letters.

Silver, Burdett and Company

New York Newark Boston Chicago San Francisco



THE ESSENTIAL THINGS In the First Two Years of Latin Study

IMAGINATIVE interest through a vivid historical background . . . A strong and systematic foundation for further study. . . . Carefully prepared exercises which furnish constant recurrence of vocabulary, forms, and syntax. . . . Numerous interesting Latin Readings by which the pupil can measure his progress and gain a feeling of achievement . . . Constant comparison with English words and syntax. . . . Sufficient study of Caesar's Gallic War. . . . Exercises in Latin Composition and in Derivation. . . . Agreement with the *Classical Report*.

These are all found in PLACE'S LATIN SERIES

By PERLEY OAKLAND PLACE, Litt.D.,
Professor of Latin in Syracuse University

First Year Latin.....	\$1.32	First Year Latin, Enlarged, including Intermediate Latin Lessons.....	1.40
Intermediate Latin Lessons.....	.40	Second Latin Course.....	1.68

AMERICAN BOOK COMPANY

New York Cincinnati Chicago Boston Atlanta

To be
Published in
March
1932



432 pages
Illustrated
\$2.25

THE PRIVATE LIFE OF THE ROMANS

A modernization of that authoritative book by the late Harold Whetstone Johnston, Ph.D.
By Miss MARY JOHNSTON, MACMURRAY College, Jacksonville, Illinois

The steady year-by-year demand since its original publication in 1908—not only in the United States but in foreign countries—indicates its standing. Now revised by Dr. Johnston's daughter as a tribute to his memory. An excellent book for the classroom or reference shelf to help the student develop the cultural objectives of the Latin Course.

REPRESENTATIVE CHAPTERS:

The Family—Roman Names—Marriage and the Position of Women—Children and Education—The House and its Furniture—Dress and Personal Ornaments—Food and Meals—Farming and Country Life—Burial Places and Funeral Ceremonies—Roman Religion—Water Supply.

Write for detailed information

S C O T T , F O R E S M A N A N D C O M P A N Y
Chicago *Atlanta* *Dallas* *New York*

The Classical Association of the Atlantic States

THE TWENTY-FIFTH ANNUAL MEETING
OF
THE CLASSICAL ASSOCIATION OF THE ATLANTIC STATES
WILL BE HELD
ON FRIDAY AND SATURDAY, MAY 6-7
AT
CENTRAL HIGH SCHOOL, PHILADELPHIA, PENNSYLVANIA

The sessions of the meeting will be open to all persons, whether they are members of the Association or not.